SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : Madam, I want to raise a question. The whole country knows about the acid attack on an I.A.S. officer. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu) : Madam, he is unnecessarily raising this matter here. This is a law and order problem of Tamil Nadu. An F.I.R. has already been filed. I dont know whether he has any *locus standi* to raise this matter. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : There must be a C.B.I. inquiry. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Madam, this is a law and order problem concerning Tamil Nadu. How can this gentleman raise this matter ? He has no reason to raise this. (*Interruptions*).. The F.I.R. has already been filed. How can this gentleman raise this question ? (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Fernandes. What do you want to say ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : This matter has already been taken up by the Tamil Nadu Government. An F.I.R. has been filed. Three are apprehended. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : A criminal came from Bombay. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you are not taking my directive seriously I will not permit anybody to speak anything. (*Interruptions*)... It would not be recorded. Mr. Fernandes. (*Interruptions*)... That matter is closed. Mr. Fernandes. (*Interruptions*)... That matter is over.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa) : Madam, there is racial violence in Europe, specially in Germany. It is a tragedy that one part of the history is repeated. Nowadays, we see on the television that there is racial violence and people from Asia who have settled there have been attacked. So, I would like to know from the External Affairs Minister whether the people of Indian origin have been attacked. We have to condemn this, Madam. (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : One by one. Please be very precise.

RE DISINVESTMENT OF SHARES BY PUBLIC SECTOR UNDERTAKINGS

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Madam, I will be very precise and you will also support me on the subject I am talking about. In the last years Budget the Government had decided to disinvest public sector unit shares to the extent of Rs. 3,500 crores. That was the revenue expected during this year. They have already sold two or three lots this year and recovered Rs. 600 crores. In December they are going to sell shares worth another Rs. 3,000 crores. Why I am bringing this to the attention of the Government is that the first three lots have been undersold to a very large extent. I will just give two or three examples so that it is very clear. In the first round the average price of shares of the Steel Authority of India was Rs. 13.24. In the third round it was increased to Rs. 40.40, threefold increase by their own methods. But the price quoted in the stock exchange is Rs. 200. Now there is no reason why the Government should sell its own assets at less than the market value. On the one-side the Government says it is short of money and there is resource crunch. On the other side we are in a hurry to sell our assets at a highly under-valued price. Madam, this is absolutely untenable by any canons of financial law. If Government furniture, second-hand furniture, is sold without calling for tenders, the official is hauled up and punitive action is taken. Here, shares worth thousands of crores of rupees are being sold by a so called committee whose Chairman is Mr. V. Krishnamurthy the less I say, the better. Now a second committee is constituted. The Government officials are going to determine the price and sell share worth thousands of crores of rupees and there is nobody to question. Madam, I demand that any further sale of public sector shares should be under the scrutiny of Parliament, either by a specially constituted parliamentary committee or the JPC can look into it. I have no objection. But the Government must

realise the full value for whatever assets Government wants to sell. The Institute of Public Enterprises, made a study about last years public sector disinvestment and has come to the conclusion that money realised was Rs. 3000 and odd crores .. (*Interruptions*)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think you are far from being precise.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : I am very precise. They have collected unit-wise and share-wise data and have drawn up a chart. The value realised should have been Rs. 6,536 crores and the Government realised less than half the value which is available in the market. People are ready to pay. I suggest the Government issue shares in the market. Let 10,000, 20,000 investors take advantage of it. Government will get more money and it will not be accused of allowing 3 or 4 or 10 people to take advantage of it. The Finance Minister has reportedly told the press that public issue takes a long time. I can understand why last year they were in a hurry. But they had this whole year on hand. Even now, between now and March, easily a public issue can be organised. The private entrepreneurs do it in 3 months. There is no reason why you cannot do it. Why should Mutual Funds make money at the expense of the Government ? Mr. V. P. Singh has asked for an inquiry has said that JPC should inquire into it. I am not going to that extent. But I do feel, if the public sector disinvestment method, specially the December package is not stopped and if the Government does not follow a proper procedure it will become a scandal bigger than the scam. It is a parallel scandal. We are selling shares and there is a difference between the market price and the price you have realised. The difference is Rs. 5,000 crores. What are we doing ? We are always saying there is no money and we under sell our assets by Rs. 5,000 crores. Now, should the Parliament keep quite... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal) : Madam, it is a matter of deep concern... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have identified Mr. Jagesh Desai. Please, will you take your seat ?

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra) : I had raised this issue in the last session when the Prime Minister was sitting here. Today the book value of public sector undertakings, all the undertakings, is Rs. 70,000 crores. But if the market value is taken, then it is Rs. 7 lakh crores. Ten times more. The shares are sold at throw-away prices. These shares belong to the people of the country. Government shares means shares of the people of the country. Last time also I said that when shares of public sector are being disinvested a committee should be formed. This is a committee of only officials. Why not some of the Members of Parliament be taken into this committee so that the people of the country can get full value for the shares which are disinvested ? I request the Government because if it is limited to Mutual Funds then they will form cartels and they will sell it at low prices. That is why it should be open to all. Why only to Mutual Funds ? First of all, I would like the Government to reconsider it. Only to bring down the deficit to 6 per cent you are selling shares. I request the Government that they should again look into it and see that a committee is formed where peoples representation is there. After that disinvestment should be done. It should be open to all. If this is not done, Madam, as Mr. Kamal Morarka has rightly said, there will be a scandal again.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Desai ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : The shares should not be sold at a lower price. The Government should look into it.

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) : मैं केवल एक मिनट के लिए यह जो कमल जी ने मसला उठाया है, इसका समर्थन करने के लिए खड़ी हुई हूं। अगर हम तकनीकियों में न भी जाएं तो भी बड़ी मोटी समझ की बात है कि कोई आदमी अगर अपनी सम्पत्ति बेंचता है तो उसकी ज्यादा से ज्यादा कीमत वसूलने की कोशिश होती है लेकिन यहां करोड़ों रुपए की सरकारी सम्पत्ति बेची जा रही है लेकिन जैसे किसी को दर्द ही नहीं है, मोह ही नहीं है और सरकार आंखें मूंदे बैठी है। संसद में

मसला उठता है लेकिन उसकी भी अन-देखी की जाती है। जैसे अभी जगेश जी ने कहा है कि बुक वेल्यू और मार्किट वेल्यू में भी फर्क है, लेकिन बुक वेल्यू पर भी नहीं बेची जा रही है जैसे किसी का कुछ लगता ही नहीं है बल्कि लावारिसों की सम्पत्ति की तरह से सरकारी शेयर बेचे जा रहे हैं। इसलिए मैं आपके माध्यम से कहना चाहती हूं, इन लोगों के साथ अपने आपको एसोसिएट करते हुए, कि इस चीज को तुरन्त रोकना चाहिए, इस पर रोक लगाई जानी चाहिए और एक संसदीय समिति बनाकर के उसकी निगरानी में ये शेयर्स बेचे जाने चाहिए। एक तरफ सरकार इतना-इतना घाटा उठा रही है और उस घाटे की पूर्ति इससे हो सकती है लेकिन दूसरी तरफ इसको लावारिसों की सम्पत्ति की तरह से बेचकर के और घाटा उठाने का काम सरकार कर रही है। तो इस के लिए एक संसदीय समिति बने और उसकी निगरानी में ये शेयर्स बिकें, यह मेरी मांग है आप से।

उपसभापति : ओ० के०। ठीक है, सुषमा जी।

...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI (Gujarat) : We cannot tolerate this...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : This should be stopped..(*Interruptions*)

उपसभापति : साल्वे साहब, आप भी इसी मसले पर बोल रहे हैं ?

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : (महाराष्ट्र) : हां मैडम, इसी मसले पर।

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : At least the Government should react.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Madam, I have not studied the facts and figures and, therefore, I have no idea of the dimension...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : Then why have you got up ?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : I am on principle ..(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, order.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : I am on principle. What is being alleged is extremely serious. One thing that happens is that in these things, there is no transparency. Hardly any official would say as to what is happening. The bureaucrats want to put this country into liquidation. I am unable to understand, when responsible Members have stated certain facts and figures, why the Finance Minister doesn't come here and explain to us what the exact situation is..(*Interruptions*).. I demand on behalf of the House...(*Interruptions*)

श्री अजीत जोगी (मध्य प्रदेश) : कृपया इस पर आप निर्देश दे दीजिए, मैडम, पूरा हाउस इससे कन्सर्न्ड है। .... (व्यवधान) ....

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : I demand on behalf of the House...(*Interruptions*) what is there to hide ? There is nothing to hide .... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI : We are all concerned about it. Cutting across the party lines, we are all concerned about it. ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : We want transparency in these matters...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : The Government stop this..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI : The BJP, the Janata Dal, the Communists, the Congress, everybody, is concerned about it..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Under the garb of secrecy, far too much damage has already been done to the country and public interest has been bartered away. This is my allegation, Madam...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI AJIT P. K. JOGI : Kindly issue instructions from the Chair...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Therefore, why don't you come clean to the House with what you have done, what your policy is,

what your guidelines are and why you are putting Government to this kind of unjustified, utterly criminal loss.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Parliamentary Affairs Minister will convey your sentiments to the Finance Minister... (*Interruptions*)

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल (उत्तर प्रदेश) : मैडम, मैं एक मिनट लूंगा । ...(व्यवधान)....

DR. JITENDRA KUMAR JAIN : (Madhya Pradesh) : Madam, kindly direct the Government to react... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI : I would request the Government to react on this... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra) : A senior Member of that party is speaking. The Government must react.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We have an important business before us. We will take it up... (*Interruptions*)

श्री अजीत जोगी : आज ही वित्त मंत्री जी को यहां बुलाइए । ... (व्यवधान) ...

उपसभापति : आपको क्या कहना है ? ... (व्यवधान)... आपका काहे का मसला है ? ..... (व्यवधान)....

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar) : Madam, on this question, sombody should react. The whole House is demanding that the Finance Minister should come.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The sentiments will be conveyed to the Finance Minister... (*Interruptions*)

श्री एन०के०पी०साल्वे : आज न आएं, लेकिन यहां आकर बताएं कि क्या बात है? ...(व्यवधान)...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB) : It will be conveyed to the Finance Minister... (*Interruptions*)

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : मैडम, यह पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है । ....

(व्यवधान)... मैडम, यह पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है, कृपा करके इसे पार्टी का सवाल न बनाएं । ...(व्यवधान)..... मैडम, वे आकर बताएं यहां कि क्या बात है ? ...(व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let Mr. Jacob have some time to convey the message. How can he do it immediately ? He doesn't have a remote control... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Mr. Jacob should assure us that no further sale would take place till the matter is descussed... (*Interruptions*)

श्री एन० पी० के० साल्वे : मैडम, यह पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He will take it up, Mr. Salve... (*Interruptions*)

श्री एम० के० पी० साल्वे : मैडम, यह पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है । प्रमोद जी ने ...(व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I know it is not a party matter... (*Interruptions*)

श्री एन० के० पी० साल्वे : मैडम, यह पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है । प्रमोद जी ने कहा था, यह पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है, कृपया इसे पार्टी का सवाल न बनाएं । ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT (Madhya Pradesh) : It is more serious than making a mere statement.. (*Interruptions*)

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : मैडम, मैं कह रहा हूं कि सत्ता पक्ष का कोई महत्वपूर्ण व्यक्ति अगर इस तरह के विचार व्यक्त करता है तो सरकार को कोई न कोई प्रतिक्रिया देनी चाहिए । मैं इसको दलों में विभाजित नहीं कर रहा हूं ... (व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, no more discussion. That matter is over. The Minister for Parliamentary Affairs has reacted to it and he will convey the sentiments of the House to the Minister concerned. I cannot go beyond tha .. (*Inter-*

ruptions)...I cannot go beyond that... (*interruptions*)...

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER (Gujarat) : Madam, may I just...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Shiv Shanker, we cannot have a discussion on it. We do not have anything.

SHRI P. SHIV SHANKER : I am slightly confused. You have been pleased to observe that the sentiments of the House will be conveyed. Does it include the Ministers also ?

SHRI M. M. JACOB : Yes, very much, Madam.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Those Ministers are Members of this House. I do not think they will disassociate from this House.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल उर्फ मीम अफजल : मैडम, आपने मुझे इजाजत दी थी। इसलिए मैं··· (व्यवधान)

मैडम, उत्तर प्रदेश के चीफ मिनिस्टर साहब ने एक वीडियो मेग्जीन को एक इंटरव्यू दिया है और वह इंटरव्यू आज इंडियन एक्सप्रेस के फ्रंट पेज पर छपा है। ····· (व्यवधान) मैडम, इसके अंदर सुप्रीम कोर्ट की ···· (व्यवधान)

This is a very important matter.

†شری محمد افضل عرف م ۔ افضل۔
میڈم آپ نے مجھے عزت دی تھی
اس لیے میں ....."مداخلت"...
میڈم اتر پردیش کے چیف منسٹر صاحب
نے ایک ویڈیو میگزین کو ایک انٹرویو
دیا ہے ۔ اور وہ انٹرویو آج انڈین ایکسپریس
کے فرنٹ پیج پر چھپا ہے ..."مداخلت"...
میڈم اس کے اندر سپریم کورٹ کی
....."مداخلت"...

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

उपसभापति : आप उत्तर प्रदेश के अंदर बात करें, यहां नहीं । ···
(व्यवधान)

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : It is a very serious matter. It is a very important and very serious matter.

SHRI P. UPENDRA : It is a very serious matter.

SHRI MANTAY PADMANABHAM : The UP Chief Minister is on record and told the media that the Prime Minister gave him word that he would be referring this matter to the Supreme Court and would obtain a favourable order from the Supreme Court.

श्री मोहम्मद अफजल मीम उर्फ अफजल : उत्तर प्रदेश के चीफ मिनिस्टर ने यह इल्जाम लगाया है कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर की मौजूदगी में डिफेंस मिनिस्टर ने उनसे यह कहा था कि अगर वह वन पोइंट रिफेरेंस को मान लें तो इससे सुप्रीम कोर्ट विश्व हिन्दू परिषद के हक में वर्डिक्ट दे सकती है। मैं यह कहता हूं कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट की तरफ से··· (व्यवधान) यह कहा है कि वह उसके हक में फैसला देगी। मैडम, शरद पवार साहब ने यह भी कहा है कि गवर्नमेंट फेस सेविंग चाहती है। ··· (व्यवधान) मैडम, शरद पवार साहब ने प्राइम मिनिस्टर की मौजूदगी में उत्तर प्रदेश के वजीरे आला से यह भी कहा कि उन्होंने वी एच पी और बाबरी मस्जिद एक्शन कमेटी के कागजात को पढ़ लिया है और वह इस नतीजे पर पहुंचे हैं कि मस्जिद तोड़ कर मन्दिर बनाया गया था इसलिए उनके हक में फैसला हो जाएगा अगर वह वनपोइंट रिफेंस को मान लें। मैडम, मैं समझता हूं कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर अगर डिफेंस मिनिस्टर की तरफ से सुप्रीम कोर्ट ··· (व्यवधान)

†شری محمدؐ افضل عرف ام۔ افضل :
اتر پردیش کے چیف منسٹر نے یہ الزام
لگایا ہے کہ پرائم منسٹر کی موجودگی میں
ڈیفنس منسٹر نے ان سے یہ کہا تھا کہ
اگر ون پوائنٹ ریفرنس کو مان لیں
تو اس سے سپریم کورٹ و شوہندو پریشد
کے حق میں ورڈکٹ دے سکتی ہے۔
میں یہ کہتا ہوں کہ سپریم کورٹ کی
طرف سے .... "مداخلت"....
یہ کہا ہے کہ وہ اس کے حق میں
فیصلہ دے گی۔ میڈم شرد پوار
صاحبہ نے یہ بھی کہا ہے کہ
گورنمنٹ تیس سیونگ چاہتی ہے۔
.... "مداخلت" .... میڈم
شرد پوار صاحبہ نے پرائم منسٹر کی
موجودگی میں اتر پردیش کے وزیر
اعلیٰ سے یہ بھی کہا کہ انھوں نے وی۔
ایچ۔ پی۔ اور بابری مسجد ایکشن
کمیٹی کے کاغذات کو پڑھ لیا ہے
اور وہ اس نتیجہ پر پہنچے ہیں کہ مسجد
توڑ کر کے مندر بنایا گیا تھا۔ اس لئے
ان کے حق میں فیصلہ ہو جائے گا۔
اگر وہ ون پوائنٹ ریفرنس کو مان
لیں۔ میڈم میں سمجھتا ہوں کہ پرائم
منسٹر اگر ڈیفنس منسٹر کی طرف سے
سپریم کورٹ کی ..... "مداخلت"....

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Afzal, anything which is said by somebody, somewhere and which appears in the newspapers, the Prime Minister cannot answer ... (*Interruptions*) ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Not everybody. Madam, he is the Cheif Minister of U.P. He is not an irresponsible person..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Nothing will go on record.. (*Interruptions*) ..The Prime Minister is capable of dealing with the State Government... (*Interruptions*)... No, I am not permitting... (*Interruptions*)... Mr. Afzal, please take your seat. I am not permitting... (*Interruptions*)... Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)... I am not permitting, Mr. Balram. I say nothing is going on record. It is not going on record ... (*Interruptions*)... It is not going on record .. Just a minute. Prime Minister is capable of dealing with the State Government and I am not permitting any reference to it over here... (*Interruptions*)... I am not permitting... (*Interruptions*)... Nothing is going are on record. That matter is closed. We have the Calling Attention which is of great importance... (*Interruptions*)... Hundreds and thousands are suffering... (*Interruptions*)... No, Mr. Afzal, will you please sit down ? Let me run this House in a proper manner. Please sit down... (*Interruptions*)... Nothing is going on record... (*Interruptions*)... Please take your seat... (*Interruptions*)... Please take your seats... (*Interruptions*)... I am not permitting anything .... (*Interruptions*)... People are suffering because of cyclone. So, I am not permitting anyhting else now. We will take up the Calling Attention Motion only now. Nothing else will go on record except what Mr. Balaram says how, Mr. Balaram, you have to call the attention of the Minister, Mr. Balram Jakhar... (*Interruptions*)... Both the sides have "Balrams" now ! ... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN : So, let us forget "Ram" for some time ! ... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No. We have to remember him twice !